Rural Healthcare Delivery in Sub-Saharan Africa: An ICT-Driven Approach

Nasir Faruk, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
N.T. Surajudeen-Bakinde, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
Abubakar Abdulkarim, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
Abdulkarim Ayopo Oloyede, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
Lukman Olawoyin, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
Olayiwola W. Bello, University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
Segun I. Popoola, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3941-5903

Thierry O.C. Edoh, Technical University of Munich, Munich, Germany
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7390-3396

ABSTRACT

Access to quality healthcare is a major problem in Sub-Saharan Africa with a doctor-to-patient ratio as high as 1:50,000, which is far above the recommended ratio by the World Health Organization (WHO) which is 1:600. This has been aggravated by the lack of access to critical infrastructures such as the health care facilities, roads, electricity, and many other factors. Even if these infrastructures are provided, the number of medical practitioners to cater for the growing population of these countries is not sufficient. In this article, how information and communication technology (ICT) can be used to drive a sustainable health care delivery system through the introduction and promotion of Virtual Clinics and various health information systems such as mobile health and electronic health record systems into the healthcare industry in Sub-Saharan Africa is presented. Furthermore, the article suggests ways of attaining successful implementation of telemedicine applications/services and remote healthcare facilities in Africa.

KEYWORDS

Africa, HDI, Health, ICT, Tele-Health, Telemedicine, Virtual Clinics

INTRODUCTION

Developing countries are characterized with low Human Development Index (HDI) relative to developed countries. The HDI composition includes life expectancy at birth, education, and per capita income. Among the global ranking of the HDI within the developing nations, Sub-Saharan Africa has the least as over 60% of African population resides in the rural communities, characterized by poor infrastructure, low income, adversely scattered buildings, low literacy level, extreme poverty, higher level of inequality resulting from unequal access and so on (Adediran, Opadiji, Faruk, & Bello,

DOI: 10.4018/IJHISI.2020070101

This article, originally published under IGI Global’s copyright on March 13, 2020 will proceed with publication as an Open Access article starting on January 14, 2021 in the gold Open Access journal, International Journal of Healthcare Information Systems and Informatics (converted to gold Open Access January 1, 2021), and will be distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and production in any medium, provided the author of the original work and original publication source are properly credited.
2016). Sub Saharan Africa also lack access to quality healthcare services. In fact, nearly half of the World Health Organization (WHO) member states in developing countries (44%) have less than 1 doctor per 1000 patients, which is above the WHO recommended ratio of 1:600 (WHO, Global Health Observatory (GHO) Data, 2016). For example, the doctor-to-patient ratio in Malawi and Tanzania is 1:50,000, while in Liberia and Mozambique it is 1:35,000 (WHO, A health telematics policy in support of WHO’s Health-For-All strategy for global health development: report of the WHO group consultation on health telematics, 1998). Therefore, even if these infrastructures are provided, the number of medical practitioners to cater for the growing population of these countries is not sufficient. However, the growing impacts of telemedicine have shown some positive effect in the healthcare delivery system, particularly for developing countries. This is because information and communication technology (ICT) can be used to drive a sustainable and verifiable system through the introduction and promotion of telemedicine and integration of various health information systems such as the electronic/mobile health and electronic health record systems.

For successful implementation of these initiatives in sub-Saharan Africa, a low-cost platforms and systems are required. In addition to this, the applications used in accessing this service must be reliable and scalable. This is because of some of the peculiarities of this region such as large-scale poverty, among other factors. It would also require sustainable and competitive business models that would enable the private investors to key into the programme. Private sector investment is critical to the success of these platforms because most government in Sub-Saharan Africa lack the fund, expertise or willingness to drive this type of initiative. Furthermore, the success and likely take-up of such initiatives would require appropriate communication campaign for the end users for the adoption and promotion of virtual clinics and e-health system. This requires assessing the current knowledge base of rural dwellers about the virtual clinics services and e-health and also, to identify health-related problems that can be solved remotely.

This article, therefore, aims to develop a framework for sustainable healthcare delivery (including health education) through development, implementation and promotion of ICT in the health care systems. Implementation framework, technical requirements for the development of virtual clinics, barriers to practice of telemedicine in developing countries, possible challenges that may be encountered during the implementation of virtual clinics in developing countries, some telemedicine case studies are all provided. Provisions are equally made for research directions and open issues for the successful implementation and integration of the ICT in the health care system.

OVERVIEW OF GLOBAL HUMAN DEVELOPMENT INDEX (HDI)

Human Development Index (HDI) is a statistical tool used to measure the overall achievement in a country’s social and economic dimensions such as the health of people, their level of education and standard of living (Nations, 2016); (Bray, Jamel, Grey, Ferlay, & Forman, 2012). The main indicators are life expectancy for health, expected years of schooling as well as the actual years of schooling for education, and the Gross National Income (GNI) per capita for the standard of living (Kpolovie, Ewansiha, & Esara, 2017). A household with members sheltered in a well-furnished house; balanced diet food cooked using clean cooking fuel; with access to stable electricity; clean and portable water; private toilets would be rated high in terms of HDI index. Figure 1 shows the global HDI from the UNDP 2017 Report (Programme, 2017). This figure shows that Africa has the least HDI when compared to other regions.

According to the United Nations Development Project Report (Programme, 2017), Nigeria had an HDI of 0.527 in 2015 which is above the average of 0.497 for countries in the low human development group. The life expectancy at birth for Nigeria is the lowest at 53.1 when compared to Democratic Republic of Congo of 59.1, Ethiopia of 64.6 and even lower than the average for Sub-Saharan Africa of 58.9. The life expectancy value in terms of the Gender Development Index (GDI) had Nigeria having the lowest value at 53.4 and 52.7 for both the female and male respectively in
comparison to Congo which had 60.5 and 57.6, Ethiopia had 66.6 and 62.7 and Sub-Saharan Africa had 60.2 and 57.6, respectively. Life expectancy in years as a component and an indicator of HDI was calculated and fixed at 20 for minimum and 85 for maximum. National-level HDIs are created to reflect the priorities and problems relevant to the concerned country’s level of development. However, the general trend shows Africa still has the least life expectancy as shown in Figure 2 (Santos, 2011).

Table 1 presents the population growth rate (%), birth rate (per 1000), infant mortality rate (per 1000), death rate (per 1000), life expectancy at birth (in years), % of GDP on Health (WHO recommends 5%) and GDP per capita (in US dollars), for three countries which are selected per region of the Africa continent making a total of fifteen countries. Malawi has more live births at a rate of 41 when compared to the birth rate of Libya which is 17.5 and the lowest among all the countries considered. More children under the age of one year died in Chad with an infant mortality rate of 85.4 while the country that recorded the fewest number of deaths among children under the age of one is Libya with an infant mortality rate of 10.8. Chad from the Central Africa has the highest number of death of 13.8 in a population of 1000 while the least death rate is recorded in the Northern Africa region with Libya recording just 3.6 deaths in a population of 1000 per year. Libya has the least population growth rate of 0.04% among the whole fifteen countries considered, while Chad has the highest rate of 3.31% according to the UN list. The lowest life expectancy of 50.2 means that Chad citizens may live up to the age of 50.2 year, while Morocco has the highest probability of living longer with a life expectancy of 76.9 years.

Only the Northern region conforms more to the 5% of GDP on Health recommended by WHO, with 5.6%, 5% and 5.9% for Egypt, Libya and Morocco respectively, while Gabon from the Central Africa having the least with 3.4%. The same Gabon, which surprisingly has the highest GDP per capital of $19300, while a ridiculous $900 is recorded for Liberia from the Western part of the continent.
Figure 2. Life expectancy list (Santos, 2011)

Table 1. Life expectancy list (Santos, 2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors/ Countries</th>
<th>Population Growth Rate% (2010 – 2015 List by the UN)</th>
<th>Birth Rate (per 1000)</th>
<th>Infant Mortality Rate (per 1000)</th>
<th>Death Rate (per 1000)</th>
<th>Life Expectancy at Birth (in Years)</th>
<th>% of GDP on Health (WHO Recommends 5%)</th>
<th>GDP per Capita (in USD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>World Standard</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>49.4</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>13000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libya</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>76.5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>21.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>8600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>49.6</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>2100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>39.9</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>3300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>43.4</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>61.2</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>1200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>2.67</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>69.8</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>53.4</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>5900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>35.2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>66.6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>4600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Republic of the Congo</td>
<td>2.56</td>
<td>34.4</td>
<td>54.9</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>59.3</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>6700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>85.4</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>50.2</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>2400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabon</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>34.2</td>
<td>44.1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>52.1</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>19300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>1.99</td>
<td>22.1</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>54.5</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>18100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>27.3</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>63.6</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>11500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>20.2</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>63.1</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>13400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE NEED FOR VIRTUAL CLINICS

There are a number of reasons for proposing the use of Virtual Clinics in Africa. According to the 2006 World Health Report, “Africa has 24% of the world’s burden of disease but only 3% of health workers commanding less than 1% of world health expenditure (WHO, Global Health Observatory (GHO) Data, 2016). Furthermore, most countries in Africa are developing economies characterised by lack of basic infrastructure, poverty, increase in population and high ratio of doctor to patient. 60% of Africans lives in rural communities with grossly inadequate health care facilities. The inadequacy and sometimes lack of basic healthcare facility in some of the rural communities in Africa especially in Sub Sahara Africa has prevented specialised care in some communities. This made a lot of the rural communities to be more vulnerable to late discovery of ailment and access to basic healthcare system (Sood, 2002). Virtual Clinic offers a drastic solution to the gross inadequate access to healthcare delivery in Africa because it allows for medical examinations of patients while also allowing the provision of additional support from an off-site expert. This can help in earlier diagnosis and quicker care especially for diseases like cancer and diabetes. Virtual clinics would also provide a platform for educating the young medical personnel by the leading experts in health and medicine while also providing a platform for effectively facilitating research over a larger geographic area.

CONCEPTUALIZING VIRTUAL CLINICS

There have been lots of literatures that coined a word describing the use of ICT in medical diagnosis and treatment. In some literatures, Telehealth were used, while some Telemedicine. (Della, 2001); (Adebayo, Faruk, & Ayeni, 2013); (Strehle & Shabde, 2002). In this framework, Virtual Clinics are clinics without border, where remote patients can access medical practitioners; diagnosis can be undertaken remotely via the help of paramedics within the virtual clinics. Essentially, the virtual clinics will consist of building fully digitized with video conferencing facilities and basic telemedicine equipment. Some of these equipment are described in Indian’s prototype which consist of solar powered tele-centres equipped with portable telemedicine workstations for recording electrocardiogram, blood pressure, heart beat rate (Pal, Mbarika, Datta, & McCoy, 2005). In advanced economy such as USA, virtual clinic models of mental health are under investigations (Beck, Manderscheid, & Buerhaus, 2018). This clearly show the commitment across the globe in this area. In the same way, recent study shows that the concept of virtual clinic is getting more acceptance among diabetic patients in the USA (Ahnood, Souriti, & Williams, 2018).

BENEFITS AND SERVICES OF VIRTUAL CLINICS

The following are some of the benefits provided by virtual clinics:

- **Provision of Clinical Supports**: Remote and real time direct patient care will be provided where health care professionals diagnose patients remotely through video conferencing with direct conversations. This helps to overcome the geographical barriers, connecting patients who are not in the same physical location with the health care professionals;
- **Clinical Data Transfer**: Sharing of compressed video, audio, medical data such as scanned X-ray, ultrasound and compressed images from one clinic to another;
- **Patient Monitoring**: Disease surveillance and patient monitoring are preventive measures. These help in providing useful information that are needed for early detection of epidemic outbreak and tactical actions for effective control;
- **Health Information, Education, and Specialist Referral**: Increasing use of digital technologies in health systems - online patient records keeping, clinical data digitalization and onward electronic
transmission, and appointment reminders by SMS - have not only reduced health resources and expenditure but have equally increased involvement of patients and lay personnel. Health education and specialist referral could be enhanced through virtual clinic implementation and integration.

TECHNICAL REQUIREMENTS FOR VIRTUAL CLINICS

The technical requirements for the virtual clinics would depend on the type of telehealth services to be provided. However, each clinic must satisfy the minimum requirements to provide the quality of services and guaranty availability. Some of these are summarized as:

- **Network Connectivity:** High Speed Broadband Internet is necessary; the network must have sufficient bandwidth to support real time delay intolerant applications such as audio. The network must be reliable and capable of providing services with minimal delay, jitter and packet losses. It must also support transmission of compressed video, audio and patient data. For optimum evaluation, a minimum of 768 kbps transmission speed is required (Adebayo, Faruk, & Ayeni, 2013) (Adebayo & Faruk, 2013; Adebayo et al., 2013). The connection between the health professional and the patient should appear seamlessly as if they are both in the same location. Wired broadband connectivity may not be feasible in most developing countries due to low penetration and neglects of the legacy wired backbone infrastructure, even though, it is the most reliable connection (Faruk, Adediran, & Ayeni, On the study of empirical path loss models for accurate prediction of TV signal for secondary users., 2013). Wireless communication systems can still provide the minimum data requirement. Although backhauling from fibre point of presence and/ wireless hub to far remote virtual clinics could be another bottleneck. But with the emergence of Software Define Radio (SDR) and Television White Spaces (TVWS) technologies (Faruk, Adediran, & Ayeni, On the study of empirical path loss models for accurate prediction of TV signal for secondary users., 2013) (Faruk, Surajdeen, Kolade, Ayeni, & Adediran, 2014), distant health outpost will be connected to the secondary and tertiary health centres. This backhaul network can be extended to provide point-to-point connections to the patient’s home where web-based e-health patient services could be accessed. Both access and backhaul networks must be energy efficient. A hybrid approach may also be possible where distant clustered villages macro base station could be backhauled using long range Wi-Fi or point-to-point microwave units and each of the villages will have a small cell deployed within the umbrella coverage area of the macro BTS. This approach is called self-backhauling and has been found to be energy efficient when compared to the existing backhaul systems (Faruk, Ruttik, Mutafungwa, & Jäntti, 2016). In addition, there should be a reliable end-to-end connectivity networks between VC’s;

- **Video Conferencing and Imaging Technology Facilities:** Video conferencing facilities are needed for real time communication between the health care professionals and the remote patients;

- **Health Information System (HIS):** HIS is a group of electronic medical records (EMR), electronic health records (EHR), and personal health records (PHC). The EHR provides patients health information; these include medical history, contact, hospitalizations and insurance information, family history, list of medications taken or currently prescribed, and allergies (Bello, Opadiji, Faruk, & Adediran, 2016);

- **Interoperability, Privacy, and Security:** The ICT infrastructures and facilities must be interoperable. The privacy and patient’s confidentiality requirements as properly followed in the conventional hospital must be applied in this case with strict compliance. The video conferencing systems, data bases, work stations should be encrypted to provide adequate security for the patient records;

- **Reliable Power Supply:** The clinics must have access to reliable, clean and sustainable power supply at least during the consultations. Generally, there is power deficit in Africa and the dominant of the people without access are in rural and isolated areas which are characterised
with high rates of poverty, low income, lack of supporting infrastructure and extreme terrain features making it challenging to extend the electric grid. Furthermore, the market needs and lack of access to financial resources are also constraints. Although, ordinarily, the cost of supplying grid-based electricity to these locations, should be less when compared to alternative off-grid options, but, in most cases, the distances of these remote locations to the nearby transmission and distribution lines are beyond what could be sustained. Stand-alone microgrids could be viable option for nearby clusters of villages. Also, the clinics could be designed in such a way that the power consumption of the facilities is optimum and could be sustainably powered by solar power (Abdulkarim, & Abdelkader, 2017).

DATA RATES REQUIREMENTS AND END-TO-END VIRTUAL CLINICS CONNECTIVITY

Considering the feasibility of telemedicine, adoption and implementation would certainly depend on the available telecommunication infrastructure that would sustain the services. This will however, depend on how well the health care system is able to effectively exploit the capabilities of the ICT. Although the global strive to bridge the access gap is growing and this has been the giant strive of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) (Griggs, et al., 2013) (However, universal access has not been achieved as there are still large percentages of the communities particularly in the developing countries that are currently underserved. Some technology options and universal models that would provide sustainable and cost-effective access opportunities in Africa were highlighted by (Faruk, 2017); (Bello, Faruk, & Segun, 2016) (Adediran et al., 2016; Bello et. al., 2016; Faruk et al., 2017). These models were based on the field campaigns undertaken in some rural communities in Nigeria. Table 2 illustrates a sample of some common basic and medical services and medical devices that are used in telemedicine and their data rate requirements.

In Figure 3, end-to-end connectivity for the virtual clinics is provided. Considering energy and backhaul costs issues in most Sub-Saharan Africa, the framework considers Energy Efficient (Green), TV White Space (TVWS) broadband connectivity Network infrastructure. The TVWS is the unused Ultra High Frequency (UHF) TV frequencies by TV license users. This is created as a result of the migration from analogue radio signals to digital TV radio frequencies. For example, most African

![Figure 3. End-to-end virtual clinics connectivity](image-url)
Table 2. Data rate requirement of common services and devices used by patients in telemedicine (Ackerman, Craft, Ferrante, Kratz, & Mandil, 2002)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devices/Services</th>
<th>Data Rate Requirements</th>
<th>Feasible Technology Option</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Real Time Audio Conversation</td>
<td>7.7 kbps-87.2 kbps</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>This is VoIP call and depending on the codec type.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Time Video Conversation</td>
<td>768 kbps-7 Mbps</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>Depending on the resolution of the video</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Blood Pressure Monitor</td>
<td>&gt;10 KB (data size)</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>Depending on the resolution of the image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Thermometer</td>
<td>&lt;10 KB (data size)</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>Depending on the resolution of the image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magnetic Resonance Image</td>
<td>384 KB (Image size)</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>Depending on the resolution of the image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scanned x-ray</td>
<td>1.8 MB (size)</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>Depending on the resolution of the image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compressed and full motion video</td>
<td>384 kbps-1.544 Mbps</td>
<td>Wireless</td>
<td>Depending on the compression algorithm and size of the video</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

regions have huge unused UHF TV frequencies above 400 MHz. A TV White Space Device (WSD) is used to obtain TVWS frequencies as defined by the TV White Space Database (WSDB), so that it will not interfere with the TV frequencies used by licensed users. This WSD converts the unused TVWS spectrum, which can travel long distances and penetrate thick barriers, into broadband connections that can be provided freely to rural and remote areas where deploying fibre optic cables is quite difficult and/or expensive. In Figure 3, clusters of villages can be grouped and assigned to a single virtual clinic. These virtual clinics are referred to as primary health centres and have logical connections to the nearby secondary health centres that have physical infrastructures and medical personnel on ground. Critical and emergency cases could also be referred to the secondary centres. In a situation where the centres can’t handle the cases, the patient can be referred to the tertiary health centres which are mainly located in the state capitals. The Virtual Clinics generally, intend to connect rural and/or remote areas with health services in the cities, improving access to medical personnel to enable remote diagnosis, prompt treatment and/or referral to the existing health facilities where prompt medical services could be given.

**CHALLENGES OF VIRTUAL CLINICS IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES**

In real sense of it, telemedicine has the potential to deliver healthcare to rural areas of Africa. In general, it has the potential of eliminating a number of costs such as travel expenses, hospital bills, and patient transfer. However, certain challenges should be overcome in order to tap the full potential of telemedicine in Africa. This section discusses the challenges as follows:

- **Lack of International Framework:** In Africa efforts should be in place to enable medical personnel to deliver services outside their areas of jurisdictions;
- **Code Development:** Another area of concern is the development of codes that could only be recognized by the medical personnel such that international transfer of patient files would be a reality. This could be achieved with help of Skype, videoconferencing etc without breaching patient confidentiality. African countries can simply review and adopt what is obtainable in the USA, where the state medical board from different states developed a model that could ease license barriers between them, so as to allow the states access the facilities of telemedicine;
Table 3. Case studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>Location/ Country</th>
<th>Services Offered</th>
<th>Tele-Facilities</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Weissman, Zellmer, Gill, &amp; Wham, 2018)</td>
<td>Aurora Health Care, Department of Medicine</td>
<td>USA/ eastern Wisconsin</td>
<td>Genetic counselling</td>
<td>Genetics counsellors (GC)</td>
<td>The proposed model could be use by other institutions having shortage of clinical genetic professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Torous &amp; Hsin, 2018)</td>
<td>Digital therapeutic relationship</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Tool to harness, expand and potential of Digital healthcare</td>
<td>Smartphone application/ remote sensing technologies</td>
<td>Investigates the relationship between technologies and digital healthcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Alkmin, Marcolin, &amp; Santos, 2013)</td>
<td>Telecardiology</td>
<td>State of Minas Gerais/ Brazil</td>
<td>Tele-monitoring to improve Heart Failure</td>
<td>Tele-echocardiography</td>
<td>Adoption of this techniques has shown reduction in cardiac related diseases despite the fact that about 2% of homes have fixed telephone line in Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Wootton, 2008)</td>
<td>Dermatology</td>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>Remote assistant and consultation to local dermatologist</td>
<td>Robotic telepathology</td>
<td>This technique shows a significant knowledge transfer between the consultant and the referring doctor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Bhosai, Amza, &amp; Beido, 2012)</td>
<td>Ophthamology</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>Monitoring the effectiveness of eye</td>
<td>Retina Camera</td>
<td>This method reduces the transfer rate of eye patient by 80%,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Mars, Ramllall, &amp; Kaliski, 2012)</td>
<td>Psychiatry</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>Monitoring the mental state of an individual</td>
<td>Videoconferencing equipment and adequate bandwidth</td>
<td>This is used to reduce the time prisoner spent in jail awaiting the assessment of adjudicative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Odedra, lawrie, Jensen, &amp; Godman, 1993)</td>
<td>Internet based telepathology</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Internet based consultation for primary diagnosis and second opinion</td>
<td>Internet services with adequate bandwidth</td>
<td>This serves as motivation for health service provider and enhanced awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Yunkap, 2018)</td>
<td>Physician consultation and referral</td>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Use of telemedicine technologies</td>
<td>Connection is by ISDN that allows transmission of medical images and other medical information</td>
<td>This reduces the problem of doctor-patient ratio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Economy Deficiency**: Economy is another problem facing the development of development of telemedicine in Africa and developing countries. The limited resource in these countries makes it difficult to have facilities in place that could facilitate the development of this technology. Some of the facilities include absence of technology, lack of Internet in the rural areas of the developing countries. However, rural and remote areas that need the applications of telemedicine remain largely unconnected;
• **Lack of Adequate Knowledge:** The knowledge on the role of technology is another factor militating against higher penetration of telemedicine in developing countries. This problem could be addressed by organizing seminars and conferences among the decision makers. Decision makers can always make their policies in developing countries for governments at all levels to provide the necessary supports in order to achieve higher penetrations of telemedicine. Also doctors and patients need more knowledge on the advantages, applications and potentials of telemedicine in developing countries;

• **Behaviour Change Communication:** The percentage of people in Africa that uses the web-based mHealth application designed to improve access to health information is still relatively low. The impact of this effort is largely limited by unavailability of accessible content in contextual local languages. At best, less than half of the digital content is made available only in few widely-spoken languages. In addition, usage statistics revealed a digital divide access are mostly limited to most digitally connected communities (Marine, Du Loû, & Méadel, 2015);

• **Service Delivery:** Referral network to facility will be challenging due to poor communication, lack of authority, absence of a formal referral system, and mistrust in public health care facilities (Leon, Schneider, & Daviaud, 2012). Also, lack training in record-keeping and counselling limits the reliability of data. Integration of mhealth such as decision support systems, SMS reminders and linking of health records will be challenging as the rollout will be limited to only areas with cellular network coverage.

From the foregoing discussions, there are many barriers to practice of telemedicine in developing countries. These barriers could be grouped into technological, organizational, human and economical. Also, the main barriers are the change in the model which healthcare providers are using in discharging their responsibilities. Others include health information and bureaucratic difficulties. More details on the outline issues are as presented in Table 4.

From the foregoing analysis of the problems of telemedicine in Africa, it can be observed that electricity could play a great role in solving these problems. Unfortunately, majority of the isolated areas are not connected to national grid due to poverty, low income, lack of infrastructure to mention just a few. These challenges make extension of the national grid difficult and make standalone renewable energy microgrid a viable option. Among these options, wind and solar energy are the most widely proposed renewable energy sources (Akinbami, 2001).

Recent statistics by the international energy agency has shown that renewable energy contribute 16 per cent of Africa’s electricity; as in Figure 4. Unfortunately, hydropower generation accounts for approximately 80% of the continent’s electricity generation as shown in Figure 5. These figures indicate how the isolated community are left behind the Scheme of things in electricity access; and make high penetration of telemedicine unrealistic.

However, the potential of solar energy microgrids are investigated. Proper sizing of the solar energy microgrid system is site specific and depends on many factors such as the availability of solar energy potential, the weather data, storage system, the load demand and other components (Abdulkarim, Abdelkader, & Morrow, 2017)- (Abdulkarim A., et al., 2018). In Figure 6 we provided the solar energy potentials of some African countries.

Recent analysis presented has shown that solar radiation averages 4.0–6.5 kWh/m²/day and sunshine hours averages 1800–3000 h/annum (Sakaha, Diawuo, Katzenbach, & Gyamfi, 2017). Similarly, in Nigeria, this ranges from 3.5 kW/m²/day to 7.0 kWh/m²/day with 4-7.5 hours per day of sun light on the average (Akorede, O. Ibrahim, Amuda, Otuwo, & Olufeagba, 2017). In Liberia, monthly solar radiation ranges from 4-6.5 kWh/m²/day (Goanue, 2009). Most areas in South Africa received average solar radiation range between 4.5 to 6.5 kWh/m²/day and more than 2500 hours of shine per annum (Renewable Energy, 2018). Similarly, Namibia solar energy is among the best in the world with actual solar radiation average exceeding 6 kWh/m²/day and 10 hours of shine hours
Table 4. Barriers to practice of telemedicine in developing countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indices</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>Up till now, reasonable percentage (about 80%) of the populace live below poverty line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicable disease</td>
<td>Disease such as HIV, malaria, Tuberculosis (TB) and AIDS are still on the increase despite all efforts due to population growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal and child health</td>
<td>Mortality rate is still on the high side across the continent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence and conflict</td>
<td>The continent is categorised with continuous violence and conflicts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workforce and shortage</td>
<td>Number of competent healthcare personnel remain unrealistically low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical mass</td>
<td>The continent is not able to build the required capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor district health information system</td>
<td>Both resources and staff are not adequate in the continent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>Lack of high speed and other communication facilities remain a challenge to telemedicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost</td>
<td>High cost of communication equipment is serious setback to telemedicine penetration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td>Education and technological advancements are still at infancy stages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Language varies between healthcare providers and patient is a serious threat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political support</td>
<td>Lack of political will and unrealistic assumption contributes to low penetration of telemedicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>Electricity supply is mostly unreliable, in adequate, unstable and not available sometimes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4. Renewables as share of total electricity generation (Quitzow, Roehrkasten, Jacobs, & Bayer, 2016)
Figure 5. Share of hydropower and other renewables in renewable electricity generation in Africa (Quitzow, Roehrkasten, Jacobs, & Bayer, 2016)

![Graph showing share of hydropower and other renewables in Africa](image)

Source: Based on IEA (2014)

for more than 300 days per annum (Renewable Energy, 2018). Botswana is enjoying about ~3200 hours of sunshine per year average total solar radiation is 21 MJ/m²/day (Renewable Energy, 2018).

In east Africa Ethiopia has 5.58–6.66 kWh/m²/day with average sunshine of 6 hours per day (Bogale & Alemayehu, 2012). Tanzania has similar potential of 4-6 kWh/m²/day with an average of 8.5 sunlight per day (Hammar, 2011). Malawa is having similar figures of 4.20 to 5.83 kWh/m²/day and average of 8.0 hours per of sunshine (Senganimalunje & Tenthani, 2015).

Similar investigation was carried out for Central Africa in which Congo has high isolation ranging from 3.25 and 6.0 kWh/m²/day with 4-5 hours per day of sunshine hours per year (Kusakana, 2016). In similar passion Chad has between 3 and 8 kWh/m²/day of solar radiation (Soulouknga, Coulibaly, Doka, & Kofane, 2017). Finally, Gabon has between 4 to 6 kWh/m²/day with average sunshine hours of about 6 hours per day. General overview of the analysis presented has shown a great potential of Africa in solar energy. This is reasonable to claim that electricity problem could be resolve by using solar energy resources in the continent (Abdulkarim A., Abdelkader, Morrow, Falade, & Adediran, 2017).

IMPLEMENTATION FRAMEWORK

While the potential of ICTs to facilitate a better health service delivery has been emphasised in the literature, its implementation has not come without challenges in different environments. This has resulted into several implementation models/frameworks bearing in mind the peculiarity of services to be delivered and the exigencies of the location such services will be deployed. Achieving success with the initiation of telehealth service is not mainly hindered by the lack of availability of the appropriate technological tools in the market. Documented research abounds on the preponderance of tools and technologies that support telehealth (Park, 2006), (Puskin, Cohen, Ferguson, Krupinski, & Spaulding, 2010), (Chi & Demiris, 2015). These technologies support synchronous, store and forward, remote monitoring and mobile health/wellness telehealth solutions. Interventions capable of being delivered include consultation, education, social support, clinical care delivery, data collection and monitoring psychosocial/cognitive behavioural therapy among others (Shen & Naeim, 2017).
fact, Grady opined that advances in technology in the area of health care delivery have outpaced the rate at which such technologies are effectively integrated into health care systems (Grady, 2014). One of such is the disruptive innovation capability fostered by telehealth technologies, with capacity to bring about improved outcomes in significant areas. Similarly, (Nagel, Pomerleau, & Penner, 2013) also reported modalities of telehealth and the rapid evolution of technologies outpacing empirical knowledge generation in support of nursing practice (Nagel, Pomerleau, & Penner, 2013).

Whereas researchers in (Schwamm, et al., 2017), concluded that the barriers impeding telehealth implementation can be organised into 3 distinct classes which are financial, technological, and legal/regulatory barriers (Van Dyk, 2014). The major concern has been that of implementation, which has elicited quite a number of attentions from the research community. A telehealth sustainability framework presented by (Isabalija, Mbarika, & Kituyi, 2013) focused on issues bothering on social, institutional and technological environment. The interplay of these with knowledge management and donor involvement is postulated to deliver a sustainable telehealth program (Isabalija, Mbarika,
& Kituyi, 2013). A further breakdown of these can be seen in a comprehensive review of telehealth implementation frameworks of (Van Dyk, 2014), identifying a number of themes to drive a successful implementation. These are: technology (availability, accessibility and competence in use); management of change and organizational behaviour; economics, finances and costs; policy, governance and legislation; organizational design and service design; society and community; technology use and acceptance; access and quality (Van Dyk, 2014).

Supriyanto (2011) identified standards and business models as key requirement to be given attention towards sustainable implementation (Supriyanto, 2011). Towards attaining a sustainable EHR in Nigeria, (Bello, Opadiji, Faruk, & Adediran, 2016) advocated for a bottom up implementation championed by technology enthusiasts with research funding and donor support (Bello, Faruk, O., & Segun, 2016). This is to be in conjunction with regulatory bodies, supported by government agencies and embraced by practitioners and health institutions.

This further buttress the importance of stakeholders in the implementation of e-health programmes. These stakeholders as identified by (Charles & Boxerman, 2003) include employers, the patients, care providers, government authority, insurers, researchers and educators (Charles & Boxerman, 2003). The different stakeholders play distinct roles in the implementation framework which is presented in Table 5.

### Table 5. E-health stakeholders role (Charles & Boxerman, 2003)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholders</th>
<th>Activities/Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>These could be government or private concerns. They are interested in costs associated with providing the service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patients</td>
<td>Their interest lies on the ease of information access which reduces the financial cost and time taken in travelling to health facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care providers</td>
<td>They are saddled with the responsibility of timely and adequate information provisioning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government authority</td>
<td>Functions include standard regulation and uniformity of service. Implementations in public health facilities is also directly under the purview of the government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurers</td>
<td>Interested in acquiring information to be used for claims about a patient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researchers</td>
<td>Focus on research opportunities to strategically position the health sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educators</td>
<td>The relevancy and adequacy of content delivered to practitioners etc</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By implication, driving a successful implementation requires all stakeholders to play their role. This can only be ensured when there is a clearly outlined documentation to pursue the implementation. It also goes to say there is a need for coordination between the e-health stakeholders which has been identified by Rodrigues (Rodrigues, 2003).

A consolidated framework was provided by (Ross, 2016). This was based on the extraction from the literature, factors considered to be important for e-health successful implementation. They are: characteristics of the e-health innovation, outer and inner setting, individual characteristics and finally the processes involved. All these factors are multidimensional and could greatly enrich the implementation plan.

A proper articulation of the provisions of these frameworks can enhance the delivery of telehealth services and drive a successful implementation. However, a peculiar characteristic of the Nigerian rural community requires further attention in terms of connectivity and energy supply. While telecommunication penetration is improving in the country, the rural component of the improvement is near negligible. Similarly, the poor state of energy production requires special attention. With these in mind the End-to-end virtual clinics connectivity presented in Figure 3.
CONCLUSION AND RESEARCH DIRECTION/OPEN ISSUES

This paper has shown how Information and Communication Technology (ICT) can be used to drive a sustainable and veritable health care delivery system through the introduction and promotion of Virtual Clinics and integration of various health information systems such as Electronic/Mobile Health and Electronic Health Record systems into the healthcare industry in Sub- Saharan Africa. The paper provides a framework for sustainable healthcare delivery through development, implementation and promotion of energy efficient ICT in the health care systems. Furthermore, the paper identified that for a successful implementation of these initiatives in Sub- Saharan Africa, the private Sector investment is critical. This requires disruptive innovative and sustainable business models that would drive the investments.

The specific network requirements in terms of reliability, bandwidth and availability need to be assessed properly to guarantee quality services to patients. Research efforts are needed towards, gathering and analysis of the requirements necessary for electronic health record system development and coordinating policy support. A clear cut regulatory and legal framework for health policies is needed. This will include drafting the necessary legal documents for the incorporation especially the constitutions containing (Objectives of the patients, qualification of care givers, Duties of care givers, researchers, rights of patients, other ethical considerations like protection of personal health data, appointment of trustees etc).

For successful take-up, an appropriate communication campaign for the end users for adoption and promotion of virtual Clinics and e-health system is needed. This requires to assess the current knowledge base of rural dwellers about the Virtual Clinics services and e-health and to identify health-related problem that can be solved remotely. The paper recommends the use of other methods to explore the use of virtual clinics in Africa with help of questioner and other possible techniques available. This could assist in creating more awareness in the continent and among policy maker in the continent.
REFERENCES


Alkmim, M., Marcolini, M., & Santos, E. (2013). 1,000,000 Electrocardiograms by distance: an outstanding milestone for telehealth in Minas, Gerais, Brazil. *Glo Telemed eHealth update knowledge resources, 6*, 459-464.


Strehle, E., & Shabde, N. (2002). One hundred years of telemedicine: Does this new technology have a place in paediatrics? Archives of Disease in Childhood, 9(3), 25. PMID:17119071
Nasir Faruk is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Telecommunication Science and Deputy Director of the Joint Universities Preliminary Examinations Board, University of Ilorin, Nigeria. He received the Ph.D. in Electrical and Electronics Engineering at University of Ilorin, Nigeria in 2015, Masters of Science in Mobile & High-Speed Telecommunication Networks with distinction from Oxford Brookes University, Oxford, UK in 2010 and Bachelor of Science in Physics with first class honours from Kano University of Science and Technology (KUST) Wudil, Kano State, Nigeria in 2007. From 2015-2016, he was a postdoctoral researcher at the Department of Communication and Networking, School of Electrical Engineering, Aalto University, Finland where he led the group that propose an energy efficient self-backhaul solution for future heterogeneous networks. He received numerous research grants and fellowships from University of Ilorin, TETFUND, AFRINIC/FIRE, Dynamic Spectrum Alliance, Extensia Ltd. and IEEE. He has participated in the TPC of numerous international conferences. He is an author or co-author of over 80 scientific publications and his research interests lie in the areas of Radio Propagation, Spectrum management, energy efficiency of access and backhaul networks. He is a member of IEEE and IET.

Abubakar Abdulkarim is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Electrical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Ahmadu Bello University Zaria. He obtained a PhD Degree from the Queen’s University Belfast, United Kingdom, Master of Engineering (M.Eng.), University of Ilorin, and Bachelor of Engineering (B.Eng.) in Electrical Engineering, Bayero University Kano (BUK), Nigeria. He has published many technical papers in Electrical & Electronics Engineering. His research interests include Optimization of Power systems, Power Line Communication, Power Systems Control, Renewable Energy and Reliability Engineering. He is a license Engineer by the Council for the Regulation of Engineering in Nigeria (COREN). Also, He is a member of professional societies including Corporate Member, Nigerian Society of Engineers (MNSE) and Member, Institute of Electrical & Electronic Engineers, (MIEEE).

Abdulkarim A. Oloyede is currently a lecturer in the Department of Telecommunication Science at the University of Ilorin, Nigeria. He is also the Head of Kwara State University (KWASU) Radio and TV unit and an adjunct lecturer with the Electrical and Computer Engineering Department of KWASU. He is also the Vice Chairman of the Telecommunication Development Advisory Group (TDAG) of the ITU-D. He is a member appointed by the Federal Ministry of Communications, Nigeria to the Implementation committee of the ICT University of Nigeria. He received his first degree in Electrical Engineering from Bayero University in Kano, M.Sc, and PhD degree in Telecommunications Engineering from the Department of Electronics Engineering, University of York in England in 2008, 2011 and 2015 respectively. He is a registered member of both Nigeria Society of Engineers (NSE) and the Council for the Regulation of Engineering in Nigeria (COREN). His current interested includes, Engineering education, Spectrum pricing, Cognitive radio, Topology Management, and Energy efficient wireless networks. He is an author or co-author to over 35 scientific and non-scientific publications. He has presented at various conferences around the world and in reputable journals. He is also a member of the Nigeria Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for ITU –D and ITU-R where he has represented Nigeria in various conferences and meetings of ITU. He enjoys travelling.

Olayiwola Bello is an accomplished researcher in the field of Information Technology with a concentration in Information Systems development, business models, quality assurance and management. A multiple research grant and award winner including those from Transparency International and World wide Web Foundation, Olayiwola is focused on blending academic research with industry best practices.

Segun I. Popoola is currently a faculty in the Department of Electrical and Information Engineering, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria. He completed his Master of Engineering (MEng) degree in Information and Communication Engineering at Covenant University with a Distinction in June, 2018; and he was the Overall Best Graduating Masters Student. Segun graduated from Ladoke Akintola University of Technology, Ogbomoso, Nigeria in 2014 with a B.Tech (First Class) degree in Electronic and Electrical Engineering. He was awarded the Best Graduating Student in the Department of Electronic and Electrical Engineering by the Faculty of Engineering and Technology in conjunction with the Nigerian Society of Engineers (NSE). He is registered member of the Council for the Regulation of Engineering in Nigeria (COREN). He has authored and co-authored more than fifty (50) academic papers published in international peer-reviewed journals and conference proceedings. His research interests are, but not limited to: wireless communications, radio propagation modelling, Internet of Things (IoT), machine learning, and data analytics.

Lukman a. Olawoyin received his Bachelor of Engineering (B.Eng) in Electrical/Electronic Engineering at the Federal University of Technology, Akure, Nigeria in 2003. He obtained a Master of Science (M.Sc) in Modern Digital Communication System (MDCS) at the University of Sussex, United Kingdom in 2010. In 2016, he obtained his Doctoral Degree in Information and Signal Processing at the Beijing University of Posts and Telecommunication (BUPT), Beijing, China. He is a Registered Engineer, Council for the Regulation of Engineering in Nigeria (COREN). He is a member of professional societies including Corporate Member, Nigerian Society of Engineers (MNSE). His area of research interest is on signal processing, multiuser system, MIMO system, D2D communication and physical layer security.
Thierry Edoh is an associate researcher at the University of Bonn (Germany)/department of pharmacy, visiting associate lecturer at the Institute of Mathematics and Physics (IMSP)/University Abomey-Calavi, (Benin-Africa), visiting lecturer at IUT Lokossa (Benin-Africa), and an associate researcher at Technical University of Munich/ department of Applied Software Engineering (Germany). He received his Diploma in computer sciences from the Technical University of Munich in Germany and hold a Ph.D. at the German Federal Army University, where he worked for several years on the improvement of rural health care provision and access to healthcare in developing countries using ITC systems. His research interests are mobile computing, pervasive health and health informatics, telehealth and IoT in medical applications. He is an expert in telemedicine/telehealthcare, health informatics, and bio-Informatics. He is also working on an Information system in Drug Regulatory Affairs.